NIJZ and WHO Capacity building workshop 2017

DIGITAL MARKETING TO CHILDREN
Methodological challenges for linking public health silos

Book of Abstracts

Organized by:
National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
and WHO Country Office in Slovenia

Ljubljana, 12th October 2017
# Table of Contents

1. **Introduction** ..................................................................................................................... 3
2. **Programme** .......................................................................................................................... 4
3. Digital marketing – a new determinant of a healthy lifestyle and NCDs in children .......... 6
4. Digital marketing as a lifestyle determinant – technical, ethical and nutritional challenges .......................................................... 18
5. Digital “natives” – how do they perceive digital marketing? ............................................... 42
6. Digital marketing – how it works? .......................................................................................... 51
7. Comparative analyses of (digital) marketing in different lifestyle areas .............................. 59
8. Opportunities and barriers for policy interventions ............................................................... 74
9. Short statement on technological options in Slovenia .......................................................... 85
10. Conclusions and recommendations ....................................................................................... 92
11. References ............................................................................................................................... 95
Review

Digital marketing is an important challenge for public health. On the one hand, the pressure of the different industries steering and challenging our choices in life is constantly increasing, while on the other hand, public health has a lot to learn in terms of presenting its own agenda, promoting it and disseminating it also through digital marketing strategies and tools. The book of abstracts collecting the contributions from the digital marketing workshop held in Ljubljana, organised by the National Institute of Public Health in collaboration with WHO, brings a range of important contributions. They aim at strengthening the methodologies used by public health in various strategies. The main focus is the impact on developing a healthy lifestyle and preventing NCDs, starting from children. The approach of building capacity and enabling public health professionals of adopting adequate methodologies, which would help them assume a more active role in digital marketing, seems to be an important gain the process. Modernising public health approaches means also developing knowledge, means and methodologies in using IT, social media and other strategies in addressing the challenges posed by the unhealthy lifestyles and the growing problem of NCDs, which is the main global challenge. Workshop in Ljubljana and this volume represent an important contribution to this process and I have no doubt that public health professionals will make good use of the collected materials in this book.

Dr. Tit Albreht
National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
The Book of Abstracts “Digital marketing to children - Methodological challenges for linking public health silos” brings us 7 abstracts and slides on important results, insights and ideas about common methodological grounds in digital marketing, digital “natives”, comparative analyses of digital marketing and public health perspectives. Digital marketing is an increasingly important public health issue and lifestyle determinant. Children across Europe use digital media avidly and increasingly. In 2012, 15-year-olds in the countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) reported using the Internet for nearly 2 h daily (109 min) on weekdays and an extra half an hour daily at weekends. Although data on this topic is currently limited, some studies by researchers and digital media actors globally confirm that children engage with and enjoy digital marketing. Digital technologies such as the internet, social media and video games use the rapidly evolving practice of marketing and advertising, including personal data collection, high-frequency stimulus, intensive emotional manipulation etc. Children and adolescents are especially vulnerable and unaware of the magnitude of influence of digital marketing and data extraction. Therefore, they should be supported and empowered to safely engage in the digital world to fulfil their rights to information and participation under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. At the end of the book, there are some further action that could be applied on the EU level, such as clear regulation, the protection of children, raising public awareness, improving digital media literacy etc.

Dr. Helena Jeriček Klanšček
National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
1 Introduction

Digital marketing is one of the important determinants of health and it is linked to all lifestyle areas which, directly or indirectly, public health is dealing with, therefore a multidisciplinary competences and participatory approaches are needed.

National institute of public health of Slovenia (NIJZ) launched a Digital marketing initiative and together with WHO Country Office in Slovenia organized a capacity-building workshop 2017 on Digital marketing to children - Methodological challenges in linking public health siloses.

A capacity building workshop aim was to define how to proceed in the area of digital marketing, by exploring common methodological grounds in digital marketing in different lifestyle areas, to be able to discuss possible common holistic approaches. By going beyond each individual lifestyle area there is an opportunity to increase broad understanding of the problem of virtual reality and link potentials in public health.

The workshop was attended by participants from the National Institute of Public Health (NIJZ), Ministry of Health of the Republic of Slovenia, Agency for Communication Networks and Services of the Republic of Slovenia (AKOS), Ministry of Health of the Slovak Republic, European Commission, WHO Country Office in Slovenia and WHO Regional Office for Europe, Directorate-General for Health and Food Safety (DG Sante), The Open University UK, EuroHealthNet, the Faculty of media in Ljubljana, Faculty of Social Sciences of the University of Ljubljana and Slovenian nongovernmental youth organization No-Excuse.

Lectures on principles of digital marketing, legislative issues, presentation of experiences of the participating countries and possibilities for public health to act were followed by group work and round-table style discussions on recommendations for further steps.

Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič Blenkuš
National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
Programme

NIJZ and WHO Capacity building workshop 2017 on

DIGITAL MARKETING TO CHILDREN
Methodological challenges for linking public health siloses

AGENDA

Ljubljana, 12th October 2017

8.30 – 9.00  Registration

Moderators of the workshop: Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič, National Institute of Public Health Slovenia and Dr. Darina Sedláková, WHO Country Office for Slovenia

9.00 – 9.30  Welcome words and introduction

  Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič, National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
  Vesna Petrič, Ministry of Health of the Republic of Slovenia
  Artur Furtado, European Commission - DG Sante
  Darina Sedláková, WHO Country Office for Slovenia

9.20 – 9.30  Roundtable introduction of the participants

9.30 – 10.30  Session 1

9.30 - 10.00  Digital marketing – a new determinant of a healthy lifestyle and NCDs in children – Jo Jewel, WHO Regional Office for Europe
10.00 - 10.40  Digital marketing as a lifestyle determinant – technical, ethical and nutritional challenges, Dr. Mimi Tatlow-Golden, Open University, UK

10.40 – 10.55  Coffee and physical activity break

10.55 – 12.30  Session 2

10.55 – 11.15  Digital “natives” – how do they perceive digital marketing? No Excuse, Slovenia

11.15 – 11.20  Short comment from the communication perspective - Dr. Tanja Kamin, Faculty of Social Studies, University of Ljubljana

11.20 – 11.40  Digital marketing – how it works? Dr. Andrej Kovačič, Faculty of Media, Slovenia

11.40 – 11.45  Short statement on technological options in Slovenia: Petra Zupančič, Agency for communication networks and services of the Republic of Slovenia

11.45 – 12.05  Comparative analyses of (digital) marketing in different lifestyle areas – Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič, National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
12.05 – 12.10 Short comment from inequalities perspective: Cristina Chiotan, EuroHealthnet
12.10 – 12.30 Questions and answers, reflections on the morning sessions

12.30 – 13.15 Lunch and physical activity break

13.15 – 16.45 Session 3
13.15 – 13.30 Wrap up morning sessions, guidance for the afternoon work – Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič, National Institute of Public Health Slovenia
13.30 – 14.30 World-cafe/roundtable groups discussions on opportunities and challenges in the future, and enablers and inhibitory factors for capacity building (knowledge and human capacities)
14.30 – 15.00 Joint discussion on main outcomes of the group discussions

15.00 – 15.15 Coffee and physical activity break

15.15 – 16.00 Opportunities and barriers for policy interventions - Cristina Chiotan, EuroHealthnet
15.30 – 16.15 Interactive group discussion on future needs, possible future developments and possible measures
16.15 – 16.45 Discussion on the reporting back from the groups, formulation of the workshop recommendations

16.45 – 17.15 Recommendations, steps forward and conclusions of the workshop
3 Digital marketing – a new determinant of a healthy lifestyle and NCDs in children

(Jo Jewell, WHO Regional Office for Europe)

Abstract

Jo Jewell (WHO Regional Office for Europe) presented on the work of WHO together with Member States in this area – covering work on alcohol, tobacco and food marketing. He started his presentation with a broad definition of marketing, and then focused more closely on marketing promotion (including, but not limited to product advertisement). He underscored the rationale for WHO working in this area, notably that marketing effects preferences, behaviours and consumption of products that cause harm for health. The approach across alcohol, tobacco and food may differ, with sometimes slightly different policy objectives (e.g. restricting food marketing to children and adolescents, rather than adult population). The various WHO policy frameworks were described, notably the European Action Plan for the Prevention and Control of NCDs 2016-2025, which clearly calls for the use fiscal policies and marketing controls to full effect to influence demand, access and affordability for tobacco, alcohol and HFSS foods and drinks. The challenge, as WHO understands, is how to ensure implementations is supported through comprehensive restrictions. This is where digital marketing can present some specific challenges, with academic literature questioning whether existing measures implemented are “fit for purpose” in closing loopholes for digital marketing. Additionally, it was discussed whether countries are addressing issues of digital marketing in silos and not cross-sectorally.

WHO calls for a comprehensive response to the challenge of digital marketing for tobacco, alcohol and HFSS foods. Offline protections should logically be extended online. This will require a clear definition of the types of marketing covered and how this is applied in practice through legislation or other policy means. Additionally, action on internet marketing – by its nature cross-border – lends itself particularly well to EU level action (e.g. EU Directive on tobacco advertising and sponsorship).

Key Sources:

Taking on the challenge of digital marketing in the WHO European region

Jo Jewell
Technical Officer
WHO Regional Office for Europe

What is marketing promotion?

“Marketing” promotion refers to any form of commercial communication or message that is designed to, or has the effect of, increasing the recognition, appeal and/or consumption of particular products and services. It comprises anything that acts to advertise or otherwise promote a product or service.
What is digital marketing?

Digital marketing is promotional activity in digital media, maximizing impact with novel creative and/or analytical methods, including:

- Creative and social methods to activate implicit emotional persuasion
- Analytics of online behaviours, emotions, responses, preferences, behaviour and locations

Source: Tackling food marketing to children in a digital world: trans-disciplinary perspectives (WHO Europe, 2018)
Particular challenge of “user generated” content

Why act? Effects of promotions…
Why act?

Evidence indicates that the effectiveness of marketing communications depends on the reach, frequency and impact of the message (thus influencing exposure) and the content, design and execution of the marketing message (which influences the power of the communication).

Vision: what do we want to see in terms of changes to the way products are marketed?

- use fiscal policies and marketing controls to full effect to influence demand, access and affordability for tobacco, alcohol and HFSS foods and drinks
- undertake a comprehensive ban on all tobacco advertising, promotion and sponsorship
- prevent inappropriate and irresponsible advertising and marketing for alcohol that targets children and young people
- adopt strong measures that reduce the overall impact on children and adults of all forms of marketing (including online) of HFSS foods and drinks
Countries implementing MPOWER at the recommended level: Region versus global

Percentage of countries:

- Global
- WHO European Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>O</th>
<th>W</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>R</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Enforcement of bans on tobacco advertising, promotion and sponsorship

**Strengths**
- Only 6 do not enforce some ban on national mass media

**Weaknesses**
- Less than 1 in 10 countries enforce comprehensive bans as recommended

Source: Taking Stock: Tobacco control in the WHO European Region in 2017

---

World Health Organization
Organisation mondiale de la Santé
World Health Organization
“Best buys” for alcohol control

Regulations over commercial and public availability of alcohol

Comprehensive restrictions or bans on alcohol advertising and promotions

Pricing policies such as excise tax increases on alcoholic beverages

Marketing of alcoholic beverages

![Bar chart showing the distribution of scores among Member States](chart.png)
### Promoting healthy food environments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority policy options</th>
<th>Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strong controls on marketing, incl. but not limited to TV advertising</strong></td>
<td>Reduce exposure of children to marketing of HFSS foods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiscal measures and price policies</td>
<td>Explore policies that affect the price of foods for consumers at point of purchase &amp; create incentives to improve nutritional quality of food supply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer-friendly front of pack labelling</td>
<td>Identify foods for which consumption should be limited or promoted through interpretative labelling; encourage product reformulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reformulation, calorie reduction, smaller portions</td>
<td>Stimulate reformulation of food products to improve nutritional composition; regulate the use of specific harmful ingredients (e.g. HFSSs); incentivize smaller portion sizes to prevent over-consumption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthier food retail environment, incl. in schools</td>
<td>Improve availability &amp; affordability of healthier food products; through strategic purchasing/procurement, in-store product location and promotion. Introduce school food policies, including food-based standards &amp; restrictions on vending machines.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### National policies on marketing of food and non-alcoholic beverages to children

- 24 countries reported having measures being implemented

- 55% define which foods and beverages are covered
- 55% define age of the children to which the measure apply
- 25% under 12 years
- 25% under 13 years
- 25% under 18 years

---

14
Are existing measures “fit for purpose”? 

Are countries addressing these challenges coherently?

HFSS foods and drinks
Tobacco and e-cigarettes
Alcohol
Evidence is building that something needs to be done

“Taken together, the creative tactics and analytics equate to a brand appointing a personal marketer to each child… encouraging them to send marketing messages to their friends, and following them throughout the day…delivering advertising with the maximum impact”

- Users are routinely tracked online using behavioural analysis techniques
- This data collected is highly valuable and sold by social platforms to advertisers
- Helping them to deliver marketing with maximum impact

Should we be doing something about it?

YES!

- WHO recommendations call for a comprehensive policy approach;
- Offline protections (e.g. TV restrictions) should logically be extended to online areas;
- The age range to which protection applies should be defined by governments, not commercial entities;
- Clear definition of the types of marketing covered and how this is applied in practice;
- Compel private Internet platforms to remove marketing;
- Action on internet marketing – by its nature cross-border – lends itself particularly well to EU level action (e.g. EU Directive on tobacco advertising and sponsorship).
What it will take to achieve change

1. Address the ethics and legality of conducting digital research using social media (esp. with children)
2. Research fully characterising the marketing people are exposed to
3. Require companies to disclose marketing spending, activities and reach and engagement
4. Collaborate with government sectors outside of health to perform policy diagnostic (e.g. which legal/regulatory entry point to use) and identify solutions

Thank you

Acknowledgement to Dr Mimi Tatiow-Golden and Dr Emma Boyland for some slides and intellectual input
4 Digital marketing as a lifestyle determinant – technical, ethical and nutritional challenges

(Dr. Mimi Tatlow-Golden, Open University, UK)

Abstract


Dr Tatlow-Golden first pointed to the children’s rights context in which the IHF and WHO reports were situated and articulated the gaps in current regulation identified by the WHO report.

She pointed to the nature of the design of digital and particularly social media and the ways in which this presents challenges both to children and young people to resist negative effects as well as to regulators to address these. These media are currently designed to be (a) addictive, (b), to extract data (c) for these data to be used to target advertising to the more vulnerable. The new advertising ecosystem is a vast and complex network in which data from all internet users (including children) is taken to personalise advertising. This is increasing the reach of unhealthy advertising and helping advertisers to target those who are most vulnerable to their messages. In particular adolescents are not protected by most regulation and they are treated as adults online. However, they consume a large amount of digital media and are developmentally not well suited to resisting advertising, for biological, social and identity-related reasons.

The Facebook “reach” of the 113 food brands most popular in retail sales and on Facebook among users aged 13 or 14 years in Ireland was identified in the IHF study (Facebook was chosen as it was the most viewed digital platform among teens in Ireland at the time, although indications now are that Instagram and Snapchat predominate). All 18 brands that Facebook estimated had the greatest “reach” in this age group featured sugar-sweetened carbonated drinks, fast foods, savoury snacks, sweets, chocolate and ice-cream. Content analyses found they used tactics of engagement, emotion and entertainment. Most frequent – more so than displaying the logo, packaging or advertised items– were prompts to interact
with ads: hashtags and invitations to like, comment and share, indicating brands’ desire that adolescents would spread marketing through their networks.

The IHF study also examined the awareness of parents in Ireland to digital food advertising. As in other countries, parents had very low awareness of this form of advertising and their ideas about it were out of date (‘pop-up ads’, etc). At the end of the study three—quarters of parents favoured regulation of these forms of advertising, demonstrating the importance of building public awareness regarding advertising in digital media.

Dr Tatlow-Golden considered whether the 'conversation' about regulating digital media may be changing in a context where politicians in the US and Europe are increasingly aware of the impact social media has (and external actors may have) on voting patterns. Finally she asked 3 questions:

- **Privacy and targeting**: Why is extraction, storage, sale of personal data and targeted advertising legally permitted for under-18s?
- **Children/youth are frequently positioned as ‘knowing subjects’**: When consuming food, data and digital privacy information. Where is the evidence that this is the case?
- **Differential susceptibility** is critical. Vulnerability is washed out in studies reporting whole-group effects of food marketing.

**Key Sources:**


Food marketing to children in a digital world
Methods, ethics, challenges
Dr. Mimi Tatlow-Golden

Lecturer in Developmental Psychology and Childhood
The Open University (UK)
The Rights framework

UNCRC, 1989

- Children have rights...
  - to protection of health, of privacy, and against economic exploitation
  - to participation (including in digital media)
- Parents should facilitate these rights
- States should support parents in this

- UNCRC, Arts. 3,4,5,12, 13,14, 16, 17, 18, 24, 32
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- UN ‘Ruggie’ Guiding principles on business and human rights
Gaps in current regulation

- Addresses “child-directed”/“children’s” media, not children’s greatest media use
- Applies to marketing targeted at children, not marketing to which they are exposed
- Nutrient Profiling methods: weak or absent
- Adolescents rarely protected
  - NB: In social media, everyone’s an adult
- Digital media rarely addressed

‘Advertised diet’ on regulation-compliant children’s TV Island of Ireland
Viewing patterns: 4-6 years (NI/RoI)

UK Nutrient Profiling (NP)
53% not permitted


WHO NP
74% not permitted
Figure 14: Estimated weekly hours of media consumption at home or elsewhere among users by age, 2016

Since the EU Kids Online 2010 survey of 25 countries, our sister project Net Children Go Mobile updated the survey in seven countries in 2014.*

Data from 11- to 16-year-olds in 2013 and 2014 for Belgium, Denmark, Italy, Ireland, Portugal, Romania, and the UK shows what they do online on a daily basis.

While they are indeed doing more than before, the number of opportunities to be online is greater.

Children are more likely to engage with social networking sites, instant messaging, YouTube, and gaming.

They are much less likely to check or upload content, read the news online, or participate in virtual worlds.

*Net Children Go Mobile surveyed 9- to 16-year-olds in Belgium, Denmark, Italy, Ireland, Portugal, Romania, UK.
Designed to be addictive

“A must read for everyone who cares about driving customer engagement.”
—Eric Ries, author of The Lean Startup


How a handful of tech companies control billions of minds every day

- https://www.ted.com/talks/tristan_harris_the_manipulative_tricks_tech_companies_use_to_capture_your_attention
Designed to extract data
Targeted advertising is the business model

Browser sniffing, Browser fingerprinting
‘Flash’, ‘Zombie’ cookies
Geo-location
Device fingerprinting, Device graphs
Social graphs ... & more

98 personal data points that Facebook uses to target ads to you

PNAS

Private traits and attributes are predictable from digital records of human behavior

Navajo This Article

Research Highlights

The data from Facebook’s app contains a wealth of information about users, including their location, interests, and even their purchasing habits. This information can be used to create targeted advertising campaigns that are more effective and efficient than traditional methods. In addition, the data can also be used to study the behavior of users and the effectiveness of different marketing strategies. The data from Facebook’s app is a valuable resource for researchers and marketers alike.
Marketing in digital media
Promotional activity in digital media, maximizing impact with novel creative and/or analytical methods

- creative and social methods to activate engagement and implicit emotional persuasion include immersive narratives; entertainment/humour; augmented reality, online games and virtual environments; social network engagement (e-Word-of-Mouth); and ‘influencers’ popular with children (e.g., YouTube video bloggers);

- analytics
  - of behaviour: hone marketing communications and maximize creative impact;
  - of emotions, responses, preferences, behaviour and locations: target specific groups, individuals, and moments of vulnerability.

Tatlow-Golden, Verdoost, Oates, Jewell, Breda & Boyland, WHO Public Health Panorama, forthcoming

Inbound Marketing
Context Marketing is the New Content Marketing: Are You Ready?
By Karen Toler Dec 7, 2015

Buyer ‘personas’
Buyer ‘journeys’
Contextual data
https://www.kunocreativa.com/blog/context-marketing-content-marketing
Designed to target = greater vulnerability

Finding Orchids in a Field of Dandelions: Understanding Children’s Differential Susceptibility to Media Effects

Jessica Taylor Petrowski and Patti M. Valkenburg

Abstract
Most youth and media-researchers do not believe that媒体 affect all youth in the same manner or to the same degree. While most media effects theories reflect this belief, empirical efforts often do not. Rather than conceptualizing individual differences as mere or nuisance variables, we argue that the future of media effects research lies within understanding these differences. In this article, we aim to help youth media-researchers identify appropriate moderators for study inclusion. We discuss the concept of differential susceptibility with a particular focus on the differences between artifact and additive effects. Highlighting theoretical and analytical applications of this susceptibility paradigm to media effects research, we believe that a more integrative approach to youth and media research, built on differential susceptibility paradigms, in which moderator effects are thoughtfully integrated, a priori, can provide us with nuanced answers to the complex questions associated with youth and media effects.

Digital ‘natives? Problematic concept… and doesn’t confer protection

 Aren’t children protected?

- Under-13s:
  - Online Behavioural Advertising not permitted
- BUT
- Can collect data with ‘verifiable parental permission’
Ethical and legal challenges

- Children’s data
- Public or private?
- Valid consent?
- Sensitive information
- Security of processing
- Withdrawal of data
- Benefits and harms

Tatlow-Golden, Verdocht, Oates, Jewell, Breda & Boyland, WHO Public Health Panorama forthcoming

Ireland
Top 100 retail brands: 73 food, drink websites

Nearly 1 in 5 have teen appeal
Social media marketing

- Brand Pages – Build a ‘closer relationship’ with social media users
- Ask them to be a ‘friend’/‘follow’/‘like’/‘tag’ others...
- Brand posts appear like friends’ news and updates
- User-generated content

Adolescents’ presentation of food in social media: An explorative study
Christopher Holmberg 1,2*, John E. Chaplin 1, Thomas Hillman 1, Christine Berg 1

#14 år (14 years)
85% shared food images
68% energy-dense, nutrient poor
21% fruit & veg
Digital marketing impact: Industry research

1. Amplifies TV & other effects
   - reach
   - recall
   - brand likeability (Facebook, 2015)
   - 70% increase of TV effects (Microsoft, 2010)

2. Greater effects for less spend
   - x4 direct return, vs TV (Peterson, 2014)
   - x3 recall compared to control groups (Gibbs & Bracht, 2010)
Do teens make informed choices?

Our promise.
At Mars we take our responsibility for marketing our brands appropriately very seriously.
... Marketing Code ... states that we only promote our products to people aged 12 and over as this is the age at which we believe that people can make informed choices about sensible snack consumption.

Are teens interested in digital marketing?

UK 13-17y online (Logicalis, 2016):

- 73% follow brands they like
- 62% click on ads
- 57% make in-app or in-game purchases
- Media-literate but... susceptible to emotional, networked, social effects of advertising
‘Informed choices’?

‘Media literate’ = can recognise ads, understand persuasion and yet...

Adolescent developmental needs
• Social: Connect with peers
• Biological: More impulsive, more responsive to HFSS ads than adults
• Identity: social media, HFSS foods are actively used

Cowen et al., 2014; Harris et al., 2009; Harris et al., 2014; Leman et al., 2015; McCannor et al., 2006; Petley et al., 2009; Fizgirld et al., 2010, 2012; Gareau, 2009; Broad et al., 2011; Trew et al., 2007

Social Influence on Risk Perception During Adolescence

Lisa J. Knoll1, Lucia Magis-Weinberg2, Maarten Speekenbrink3, and Sarah-Jayne Blakemore1

1 Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience and Department of Experimental Psychology, University College London

... of social influence on risk perception from late childhood through adulthood. Five hundred and ninety-three participants rated the likelihood of everyday situations and were then informed about the ratings of a social-influence group (teenagers or adults) before rating each situation again. All age groups showed a significant social-influence effect, changing their risk ratings in the direction of the provided ratings; this social-influence effect decreased with age.

Next, age groups adjusted their ratings more to conform to the ratings of the adult social-influence group than to the ratings of the teenager social-influence group. Only young adolescents were more strongly influenced by the teenager social-influence group than they were by the adult social-influence group, which suggests that to early adolescents, the opinions of other teenagers about risk matter more than the opinions of adults.
In social media, young adolescents...

recall and recognise unhealthy food brands more than healthy- or non-food brands

Sheppard, Rooney, Murphy, Boyland & Tatlow-Golden (under review)

Awareness:
The first step in the hierarchy of effects
(Kelly et al. 2015)

In social media, young adolescents...

... would share content and like profiles more that feature food marketing for unhealthy items

Murphy, Tatlow-Golden, Boyland & Rooney (in preparation)

Unhealthy food items – role in adolescent identity
Parents’ views

‘Great maturity needed not to fall for it’ - ‘messages from people they idolise’

‘Dishonest’ – ‘immoral’

‘Advertise by stealth’

‘They’re much more subtle than first thought’

‘I asked my children if they see much online advertising and they said yes, they did’

3 in 4 felt regulations ‘should apply’ online

Some caveats

Digital advertising: Brands versus bots
Software fraud claims billions of dollars but the industry finds it difficult to stop

Children want...
Fewer ads 71%
Less fake news 61%
More creative content 55%
More privacy 49%
More self-control?


The Marshmallow Test

Children of today are better at delaying gratification than previous generations

Growing up more slowly? Less...

Driving
Alcohol
Sexual activity
Dating
Working for pay
Going out without parents
... not explained by time on homework, and may not be related to internet use

Interaction of all these various changes in children’s experience and outcomes has not been explored
Is the conversation changing?

Why Facebook is in a hole over data mining
John Naughton

Russian propaganda may have been shared hundreds of millions of times, new research says

Let’s take back control of our data - it’s too precious to leave to the tech giants
Ravi Nair

Ofcom chair raises prospect of regulation for Google and Facebook
Patricia Hodgson says she believes sites could be classified as publishers, as businesses face pressure over fake news

If they are ‘publishers’ they will be subject to regulation
And yet...

Cambridge Analytica isn’t worried about Facebook ad restrictions

“Facebook is largely the Wild West in terms of regulations”


SUMMARY: The Issues

- Children’s ‘advertised diet’
  - Even more unhealthy in social media?
  - Targeting creates more vulnerability

- Digital marketing: Engagement, emotion, entertainment
  - Ads grab attention, persuade covertly, subvert media literacy

- ‘Big data’ analytics
  - Amplify power of marketing
  - Target those most vulnerable

- Users’ “choice” is distorted
- Parents unaware
- Researchers’ access denied
- Children’s rights not respected
THE SEARCH FOR SOLUTIONS

- Research methods, ethics and legality remain to be specified in digital media
- Children and young people – what are their practices?
- BUT ... cognitive awareness, attitudes likely to be independent of emotional, unconscious effects of marketing
- Healthy apps, marketing, targeting, social marketing, media literacy – caution required

THE SEARCH FOR SOLUTIONS 2

- Privacy and targeting: Why is extraction, storage, sale of personal data and targeted advertising legally permitted for under-18s?
- Children/youth as knowing subjects when consuming food, data and digital privacy information. Are they?
- Differential susceptibility is critical. Vulnerability is washed out in studies reporting whole-group effects
Thank you!
mimi.tatlow-golden@open.ac.uk
www.open.ac.uk
5 Digital “natives” – how do they perceive digital marketing?
(Urška Erklavec, MPharm, Daša Kokole, MPsy, No Excuse Slovenia)

Abstract

The aim of the research was to preliminary explore young people’s experiences with the digital world and their perceptions of the digital marketing. Data was obtained with 5 focus groups in the groups of 15 to 19 year old students.

Participants are mainly using the social networks such as Facebook, Instagram, Snapchat and Youtube. Most of the participants are not aware of the technical background of the digital environment. When asked about separation between online and real world, the participants showed awareness that what one presents online are often only the positive events, which can skew other people’s perception of real world. Majority of participants saw online world as a means of communication that enables them to meet and socialize in real life. Participants are aware of the possibility of leaving your digital information for others to see. As negative sides participants mentioned loss of actual privacy, as well as loss of feeling of security and privacy, and use of available information by other parties (e.g. advertisers). Participants generally noticed marketing in the digital environment, most commonly in forms of Instagram ads, Youtube advertisement before a video is shown, pop-up ads. Some find that disturbing and some are also aware that the ads that are being shown to them influence them wanting the product. Often mentioned was also the influence of cookies and how they are influencing (personalizing) the ads that are being shown to them. There was some difference between younger and older participants, with younger participants having an opinion that online marketing should be regulated, whereas the older participants were of an opinion that such regulation would be very hard as the companies will always find another way. Additionally they thought more can be done on individual level, by using services such as Ad blocker and educating yourself about the topic and being aware of when you are a target of advertising. Age restrictions (on Facebook) were not seen as useful, as they (and many other young people) can set their age to anything (so they can use facebook even before they are 13).

In general, participants thought digital marketing is an important topic. On one hand they are aware of potential benefits (e.g. making shopping easy), but on the other hand they also see it as intrusive and having potential negative consequences.

Key Source:
• Preliminary study with focus groups
Digital natives – how do they perceive digital marketing?

Digital native

- a person that grows-up in the digital age, rather than acquiring familiarity with digital systems as an adult, as a digital immigrant
No Excuse Slovenia

- youth organization in a public interest
- strives for positive social change and personal growth of young people
- non-formal education, social participation and activation
- raising awareness among young people about actual topics and stimulating their critical thinking
- sustainable development, healthy lifestyle and active citizenship of young people

Aim of the Preliminary Study

to preliminary explore young people’s experiences with the digital world and their perceptions of the digital marketing, especially their:
- experiences with the digital world,
- opinions on living in the digital world,
- experiences with digital marketing and
- opinions about digital marketing.
Method

- 5 focus groups were carried out
- 1 focus group: males
- 1 focus group: females living in urban area
- 1 focus group: females living in rural area
- 1 focus group: younger (15-17)
- 1 focus group: older (17-19)

Experience with the Digital World

- Participants are mainly using social networks such as Facebook (for news), Instagram (for photos), to lesser extent also Snapchat
- Youtube is also used fairly often, mostly for educational and entertainment purposes
- Online gaming (mainly boys)
- Most participants were not aware of the technical background of the digital environment
Separation between Online and Real World

- participants were aware that many people only post about positive events and admitted they sometimes do it themselves too – can skew people's perception
- they see that many people are much more daring online and would say things online they would never say in real life, as it is very easy to publish your opinion

Separation between Online and Real World - cont.

- majority of the participants saw online world as means of communication that enables them to socialize in real life
- one participant mentioned that the border is crossed when you start avoiding/neglecting social life in order to replace it with the online life
Leaving your Digital Footprint Online

- Participants (especially older ones) are aware of the possibility of leaving your digital information for others to see.
- Positive sides of being visible and leaving traces online: the ability to follow what friends are doing, simplifying use of certain services (e.g., by being able to connect all your accounts into one), option of identifying people who are bullying online.
- Negative sides: loss of actual privacy, as well as loss of feeling of security and privacy, and use of available information by other parties (e.g., advertisers).

Experience with Digital Marketing

- most commonly noticed: Instagram and Facebook ads, Youtube advertisement before a video is shown, pop-up ads
- also noticed: influence of cookies and how they effect the ads displayed to them (e.g., based on their conversations, previous search)
- generally they think it is an important topic
Obličite nas pod Chups Chups šotorom v soboto pri HM Mercator Šiška in v nedeljo na Čarobnem dnevu v Voščjem potoku! Se bomo zabavali, sladkari, poleplili vas bomo s tanji in še kaj se bo naslikalo.

Ker dober glas seže v deveto vsas, se poselili kar 10 nogometaših čog in 10 vrečk z izkami med testo, ki boste objavili vstavali, komentarji in deli (Se vidimo!)

Vino ljubljana
Sponsored • 0

Živo,

Zdravstvenih

Vam.

Heineman Mesto Kolesari
Sponsored • 0

Zdravstvenih

Vam.

Nalazhi aplikacije sedaj
Install Now

Ljubljana

Horo

Kukuruz

1 texta
Opinions on Regulation

- younger participants thought online marketing should be regulated (e.g. alcohol, tobacco).
- older participants were more of an opinion that such regulation would be futile as the companies will always find another way to promote their products
- they thought more can be done on individual level, by using services such as Ad blocker and educating yourself about the topic and being aware of when you are a target of advertising.

Conclusion

- Mainly through social networks
- Aware that digital does not reflect real
- Digital footprint is perceived as helpful and threatening to privacy
- Most commonly Youtube and Instgram ads
- More regulation of digital marketing is wanted
Thank you!

Urška Erklavec, No Excuse Slovenia
urska.erklavec@noexcuse.si
www.noexcuse.si
@NoExcuseSlo
www.facebook.com/noexcuseslovenia
Digital marketing – how it works?

(Dr. Andrej Kovačič, Faculty of Media, Slovenia)

Abstract

With advanced communication techniques described in this presentation, professionals create and anchor pleasant feelings on the brand name they promote. Regardless whether stimulus anchoring comes in a form of sponsorship, direct ads or product placement, children are programmed to spend more time and become more addicted to media trance in order to get more and more commercially oriented hypnotic suggestions. The „battle” for young consumers intensifies on the internet, where regulation is scarce and with the advances in technology more and more aggressive emotional excitement is aroused in younger and younger children. High frequency stimulus, intensive emotional manipulation and deep trance phenomena are used by professionals on subconscious level to target individuals and their weaknesses. Unfortunately children, parents, communities and regulators are unaware of the magnitude of influence and data extraction (in creating a consumer profile) and (or) feel helpless preventing it.

First, we urgently need official recommendation for (future) parents and teachers regarding the recommended screen exposure - especially for the youngest. We have to provide quality education on the subliminal techniques used in marketing. Finally, we also need to balance commercial (unhealthy) marketing with substantial and professionally created healthy lifestyle advertising.

We have to make ACTION now - before people play virtual reality games on the back seat of a self-driving car unable to communicate to anyone else but a computer. The knowledge of advanced influence techniques has to be used to create a future society where people are not only programmed consumers with complete data profiles that is never deleted but also humans who are able to express their own opinions and emotions and thus live a quality life.

Key Sources:
- www.pismenost.si [1 October 2017].
Finding emotional excitement in:

- face-to-face communication
- computer assisted communication
- computer satisfied communication
How does it work?

Advertising
- ANCHORING (stimulus - response – Pavlov, 1902) of POSITIVE EMOTIONS on the BRAND NAME (trademark)
- (post) hypnotic SUGGESTIONS for ACTION (PURCHASE)

All EMOTIONS fall into three categories:
- reptilian (eg. sex-related content – 3 years +)
- pro-social (eg. virtual communities, online games…)
- individualistic (eg. violence, instant rewards, praisings, supreme graphics)

↑ extremes = ↑ arousement = ↑ anchoring

What suggestions do we get in our subconscious mind?

Anaconda (Nicki Minaj – 2014)
One in my purse, bitch, I came dressed to kill
Who wanna go first? I had them pushing daffodil's
I'm high as hell, I only took a half a pill
I'm on some dumb shit, by the way, what he say?
He can tell I ain't missing no meals
Come through and fuck him in my automobile
Oh my gosh, look at her butt...
Yeah, he love this fat ass, hahaha!
Yeah! This one is for my bitches
with a fat ass in the fucking club
I said, where my fat ass big bitches in the club?
Fuck the skinny bitches!
Fuck the skinny bitches in the club!
I wanna see all the big fat ass bitches
in the muthafuckin' club
Fuck you if you skinny bitches, what?! Kyuh

Dirry (Cristina Aguilera - 2002)
...I need that (uh) to get me off
Sweating 'til my clothes come off
Let's get open, cause a commotion
Still going, 8 in the morning
There's no stopping, we keep it popping
Hard rocking, everyone's talking
Give all you got (give it to me), just hit the spot
Gonna get my girls, get your boys, gonna make some noise
Wanna get dirry
It's about time that I came to start the party
Sweat dripping over my body
It's about time for my arrival...
Uh, what

Dying light (game 2015 - )
Fuck Fuck Fuck Fuck, Kill them, ....
Deep trance

... is crucial for media to deliver and entertain.

Somnambulistic states provide:

- time distortion
- no feelings of pain
- pleasant feelings
- increased suggestibility
- no conscious knowledge of ever being influenced
  (this is the most valuable for advertisers)

---

USA leads the way

Media Use Over Time

Among all 8- to 18-year-olds, average amount of time spent with each medium in a typical day:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>1999</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TV content</td>
<td>4:29a</td>
<td>3:51b</td>
<td>3:47b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music/audio</td>
<td>2:31a</td>
<td>1:44b</td>
<td>1:48b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer</td>
<td>1:29a</td>
<td>1:02b</td>
<td>.27c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video games</td>
<td>1:13a</td>
<td>.49b</td>
<td>.26c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print</td>
<td>.38a</td>
<td>.25ab</td>
<td>.25ab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movies</td>
<td>.25a</td>
<td>.25ab</td>
<td>.18b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL MEDIA EXPOSURE</td>
<td>10:45a</td>
<td>8:33b</td>
<td>7:29c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multitasking proportion</td>
<td>39%a</td>
<td>36%a</td>
<td>16%b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL MEDIA USE</td>
<td>7:38a</td>
<td>6:21b</td>
<td>6:19b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

83% percent of parents stated that kids spend too much time using electronic devices

via http://www.rasmussenreports.com
When you DIE in a computer game you only lose a life.

When you kill someone in a game you get more points.

When you play you get instant pleasure that gets better every time as trance deepens…

The more realistic ("virtual") reality more easily gains control and makes more money and has more power and media and more control and more power... to eliminate all obstacles in de-humanising the human.

With no limits many people will go to extremes of becoming a plugged-in human hybrid running on oil, flour, milk and sugar.

More research

- Media literacy - Slovenia (2016, n= 300)
- Media and pre-school children in Slovenia (2016, n= 1000 parents)
- Media and secondary school Slovenia (2016, n= 800 teenagers)
- Media and elementary school Slovenia (2016, n= 2800 parents)
- Media and the disabled (2017-2018)
More media consumption with kids of all ages

- Lower life satisfaction
- Less real friends
- Less healthy lifestyle
- Lower grades
- More mental health related problems and diagnosed diseases
- More conflicts with others
- More violent behaviour
- 30% of every lesson is lost due to mobile phones in secondary schools
- ...

Internet „free“ space and guided tour

no regulation – no control – guided tour

We are:

letting generations of kids (and thus the future society)
„wonder in space“, being guided and bombarded with totally unsuitable content, presented in realistic quality with advanced techniques and with high frequency stimulus, with a clear aim to sell more (sheep to wolves).

People will not be able to resist until their life is wasted behind computers – especially computer games (as junkies). Healthy individual programmed to fail (spend money) since childhood?
If people really knew what is going on... would they want to change?

If they knew and wanted would they be able to change since they had been programmed from the childhood on?

WHO will help them re-programme (100,000+ violent acts they see by the age 18) so that when they become adults they are „OK“?

and with new technology ...
are we creating self-driving cars just so that we can play a virtual reality game also on the road?

ACTION plan - what could we DO

Educate – especially to not addicted and younger generations with examples of consequences and techniques
(obligatory education as for drugs)

Advertise – with advanced techniques on the subconscious level in virtual and realistic environments

Limits, recommendations, goals – written now!
dr. Andrej Kovačič
info@andrejkovacic.com
GSM: 031 780 070

"The Infrastructural program of Faculty for media — collecting, managing and archiving data on media literacy.« Nr, 1000-16-2915,
7 Comparative analyses of (digital) marketing in different lifestyle areas

(Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič, National Institute of Public Health Slovenia, with inputs from Austria and Slovakia)

Abstract

Digital marketing to children is linked to a range of lifestyle factors public health is dealing with. By joining forces in all lifestyle areas, namely tobacco, alcohol, gaming and gambling, physical activity, nutrition and others, including mental health, public health could identify potentials and challenges broadly and define common goals and agendas more efficiently.

Presentation is exploring the situation in Slovenia, Slovakia and Austria with regard to the following questions:
(1) Are there any rules (regulation, coregulation, selfregulation) for reducing marketing pressure of the products to children in different lifestyle areas in the country? (2) If yes, what kind of rules does exist? What channels of marketing they do apply to? Do they apply also for digital marketing? If yes, what kind of digital marketing? (3) How successful are such rules for digital marketing in a specific lifestyle area? What are the main challenges (definition of target group, age limitation, criteria, distribution channels, data privacy, tracking, monitoring, ...) in digital marketing? (4) What are the key obstacles and key facilitators for improvement of the situation (reducing or restricting pressure) in digital marketing in specified lifestyle areas? (5) What are the most promising steps forward in (reducing or restricting) pressure in digital marketing in specified lifestyle areas?

Comparative analysis of marketing approaches in different lifestyle areas in Slovenia, Slovakia and Austria is showing that traditional media are more regulated, selfregulated or coregulated than digital media. It is also observed that digital marketing in more traditional lifestyle factors, such as nutrition, tobacco and alcohol, is more regulated as in the new emerging ones, such as gaming and gambling. It seems that rules in restricting marketing specifically in physical activity lifestyle factor do not exist or are not detected. In general, fewer rules exist in the digital as in the real world.

Distribution channels were detected as more challenging in implementation of rules for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing to children as the target group definition.

The most challenging issues in digital marketing in different lifestyle areas to children are: (1) monitoring and evaluation violations of introduced restrictions, (2) online sales and advertising by companies HQ in the other countries, (3) marketing self-regulation is not successful, (4) the need for establishing a system, detecting monitoring and evaluation
marketing communication messages in all the media, including the world wide web and mobile applications, to guarantee a better surveillance.

Multidisciplinary competence and participatory approach are needed. As the key inhibitory factors for reducing the pressure of digital marketing to children in different lifestyle areas were detected (1) non-existing or inappropriate (outdated) national and EU legislation, (2) missing political will or consensus to act, (3) profitability is more important than public health, (4) internet is a non-regulated territory. Key enabling factors to reduce pressure of digital marketing to children could be (1) mobilisation of public opinion pools, (2) bringing forward consumers and citizens rights, (3) raising the awareness of consumers and citizens, (4) informing the general public about the health impacts of digital marketing and their consequences, (5) better intersectoral cooperation, (6) better international cooperation, (7) more comprehensive and effective prevention, field work, advisory services.

Key Sources:
- Restrictions on the Use of Alcohol Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 15/03 and 27/17)
- Act Amending the Health and Hygiene Safety of Foodstuffs and Products and Materials Coming in Contact with Foodstuffs Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 42/02)
- Restriction on the Use of Tobacco and Related Products Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 9/17 and 29/17)
- School Meals Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 3/13)
- Gaming Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 14/11, 108/12, 11/14 in 40/14)
- Audiovisual Media Services Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 87/11 and 84/15)
Comparative analyses of (digital) marketing in different lifestyle areas – observing patterns

Asist. Prof. Dr. Mojca Gabrijelčič Blenkuš
Mateja Juvan

NIJZ/WHO Workshop on DIGITAL MARKETING TO CHILDREN
Methodological challenges for linking public health siloses

Ljubljana, 12th October 2017

Prepared by:


• for Austria: Adelheid Weber, MSc and Mag. Andreas Weinseiss, both from Federal Ministry of Health and Women’s Affairs.

• for Slovakia: Dominika Šuranová, adviser, Department of crime prevention, Ministry of interior; Jozef Gabík, adviser, Department of communication and marketing, Ministry of agriculture and rural development; Andrea Krajíková, General Director, International Policy and European Affairs, Ministry of Economy; Elena Jablonická, WHO national counterpart, Department of International Relations and European Affairs, Ministry of Health; Soňa Senderáková-Vančíková, adviser, Department of Health promotion, Public Health Authority and Anton Škreko, General Director, media, audiovisual and copyrights, Ministry of culture.
Are there any rules (regulation, coregulation, selfregulation) for ... 

... reducing marketing pressure of the products to children?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXISTENCE OF RULES</th>
<th>ALCOHOL</th>
<th>TOBACCO</th>
<th>NUTRITION</th>
<th>PHYSICAL ACTIVITY</th>
<th>GAMBLING</th>
<th>GAMING</th>
<th>GENERAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES REGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COREGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELFREGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓

Are there any rules (regulation, coregulation, selfregulation) for ... 

... reducing digital marketing pressure of the products to children?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXISTENCE OF RULES</th>
<th>ALCOHOL</th>
<th>TOBACCO</th>
<th>NUTRITION</th>
<th>PHYSICAL ACTIVITY</th>
<th>GAMBLING</th>
<th>GAMING</th>
<th>GENERAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES REGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COREGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELFREGULATION</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓  Austria X
Are there any rules (regulation, coregulation, selfregulation) for ...

... reducing marketing pressure of the products to children?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXISTENCE OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coregulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selfregulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

... reducing digital marketing pressure of the products to children?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXISTENCE OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coregulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selfregulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓  Austria X  Slovakia O
If yes, what kind of rules exist in the “real world”?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESTRICTIONS ON PLACING ON THE MARKET / SALES / OFFERS / ORGANISATION / ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permit-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing channels (prohibition of placing on the market / sales / offers through specific marketing channels)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban on specific products (placing on the market / sales)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-exclusion of player</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full advertising bans</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional bans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bans on sponsorship and donorship</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising content</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified product labelling and packaging</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based advertising restrictions</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✔️

If yes, what kind of rules exist in the “real world”?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESTRICTIONS ON PLACING ON THE MARKET / SALES / OFFERS / ORGANISATION / ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permit-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing channels (prohibition of placing on the market / sales / offers through specific marketing channels)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban on specific products (placing on the market / sales)</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-exclusion of player</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full advertising bans</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional bans</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bans on sponsorship and donorship</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising content</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified product labelling and packaging</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based advertising restrictions</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✔️  Austria X
If yes, what kind of rules exist in the **“real world”**?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESTRICTIONS ON PLACING ON THE MARKET / SALES / OFFERS / ORGANISATION / ...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permit-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing channels (prohibition of placing on the market / sales / offers through specific marketing channels)</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban on specific products (placing on the market / sales)</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-exclusion of player</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kind</th>
<th>Working Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full advertising bans</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional bans</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bans on sponsorship and donorship</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising content</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified product labelling and packaging</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based advertising restrictions</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓, Austria O, Slovakia O

If yes, what kind of rules exist in the **digital world**?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESTRICTIONS ON PLACING ON THE MARKET / SALES / OFFERS / ORGANISATION / ...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permit-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing channels (prohibition of placing on the market / sales / offers through specific marketing channels)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban on specific products (placing on the market / sales)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-exclusion of player</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kind</th>
<th>Working Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full advertising bans</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional bans</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bans on sponsorship and donorship</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising content</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified product labelling and packaging</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based advertising restrictions</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials</td>
<td>✓ O</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓
### If yes, what kind of rules exist in the digital world?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KIND OF RULES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESTRICTIONS ON PLACING ON THE MARKET / SALES / OFFERS / ORGANISATION / ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permit-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td>✓X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time restrictions (sales / offers / organisation / ...)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing channels (prohibition of placing on the market / sales / offers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>through specific marketing channels)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban on specific products (placing on the market / sales)</td>
<td>✓X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-exclusion of player</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full advertising bans</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotional bans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bans on sponsorship and donation</td>
<td>✓X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising content</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specified product labelling and packaging</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels</td>
<td>✓X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age-based advertising restrictions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓ Austria X Slovakia O
### What kind of rules exist in the ... "real world"?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                          | ALCOHOL | TOBACCO | NUTRITION | PHYSICAL
| Full advertising bans    | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ACTIVITY |
| Promotional bans         | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GAMBLING |
| Bans on sponsorship and
donorship | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GAMING |
| Restrictions on
advertising content   | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GENERAL |
| Specified product labelling and packaging | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Age-based advertising restrictions | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |

Legend: Slovenia✓AustriaXSlovakiaO

### What kind of rules exist in the ... digital world?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADVERTISING RESTRICTIONS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                          | ALCOHOL | TOBACCO | NUTRITION | PHYSICAL
| Full advertising bans    | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ACTIVITY |
| Promotional bans         | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GAMBLING |
| Bans on sponsorship and
donorship | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GAMING |
| Restrictions on
advertising content   | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | GENERAL |
| Specified product labelling and packaging | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Restrictions on advertising through specific marketing channels | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Age-based advertising restrictions | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |
| Codes of conduct regarding inappropriate audiovisual commercials | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | |

Legend: Slovenia✓AustriaXSlovakiaO

### What channels of marketing the existing rules apply to?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MARKETING CHANNELS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                    | ALCOHOL | TOBACCO | NUTRITION | PHYSICAL
| TRADITIONAL
| MARKETING CHANNELS | ACTIVITY | GAMBLING | GAMING | GENERAL |
| Newspapers, magazines and other printed publications | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Brochures, leaflets, etc. | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Radio | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Television | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Cinemas | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Posters and other advertising surfaces and media in public spaces and at publicly visible locations – including moving picture graphics | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Roadside billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs located within a 300-metre range from schools | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Buildings and land used for education and healthcare purposes | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Automatic vending machines | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Movable points of sale | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| DIGITAL MARKETING CHANNELS | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Electronic and video carriers | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| E-mail, mobile phones, etc. | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Other electronic media (the Internet, using dedicated online advertising space, such as advertising banners, textual advertisements, or non-dedicated online space for sending virtual advertising messages via e-mail or other channels, as well as for sharing video and other advertising content on social media, including other content not posted on the advertiser’s website, but which has clearly been published by the advertiser) | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| Information society service | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
### What channels of marketing the existing rules apply to?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MARKETING CHANNELS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TRADITIONAL MARKETING CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers, magazines and other printed publications</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brochures, leaflets, etc.</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinemas</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters and other advertising surfaces and media in public spaces and at publicly visible locations — including moving picturegraphics</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roadside billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs located within a 300-metre range from schools</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buildings and land used for education and healthcare purposes</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automatic vending machines</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movable points of sale</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIGITAL MARKETING CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic and video carriers</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail, mobile phones, etc.</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other electronic media (the Internet, using dedicated online advertising space, such as advertising banners, textual advertisements, or non-dedicated online space for sending virtual advertising messages via e-mail or other channels, as well as for sharing video and other advertising content on social portals, including other content not posted on the advertiser's website, but which has clearly been published by the advertiser)</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information society service</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:** Slovenia ✓ Austria X

---

### What channels of marketing the existing rules apply to?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MARKETING CHANNELS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TRADITIONAL MARKETING CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers, magazines and other printed publications</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brochures, leaflets, etc.</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinemas</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posters and other advertising surfaces and media in public spaces and at publicly visible locations — including moving picturegraphics</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roadside billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Billboards, boards, posters and illuminated signs located within a 300-metre range from schools</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buildings and land used for education and healthcare purposes</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automatic vending machines</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movable points of sale</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIGITAL MARKETING CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic and video carriers</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail, mobile phones, etc.</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other electronic media (the Internet, using dedicated online advertising space, such as advertising banners, textual advertisements, or non-dedicated online space for sending virtual advertising messages via e-mail or other channels, as well as for sharing video and other advertising content on social portals, including other content not posted on the advertiser's website, but which has clearly been published by the advertiser)</td>
<td>✓ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information society service</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:** Slovenia ✓ Austria X Slovakia O
What are the main challenges in implementation of rules for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing (definition of target group, age limitation, criteria, distribution channels, data privacy, tracking, monitoring, ...)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAIN CHALLENGES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TARGET GROUP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of children and adolescents</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons spending much of their time at home with a consequential susceptibility to overuse of digital media (secondary school and university dropouts, unemployed, persons incapable to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISTRIBUTION CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the media aiming primarily at children and adolescents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the Internet, the Virtual World and the new digital media not yet covered by the existing legislation</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising within computer and video games</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✔

What are the main challenges in implementation of rules for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing (definition of target group, age limitation, criteria, distribution channels, data privacy, tracking, monitoring, ...)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAIN CHALLENGES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TARGET GROUP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of children and adolescents</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons spending much of their time at home with a consequential susceptibility to overuse of digital media (secondary school and university dropouts, unemployed, persons incapable to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISTRIBUTION CHANNELS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the media aiming primarily at children and adolescents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the Internet, the Virtual World and the new digital media not yet covered by the existing legislation</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising within computer and video games</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✔  Austria X
What are the main challenges in implementation of rules for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing (definition of target group, age limitation, criteria, distribution channels, data privacy, tracking, monitoring, ...)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAIN CHALLENGES</th>
<th>ALCOHOL</th>
<th>TOBACCO</th>
<th>NUTRITION</th>
<th>PHYSICAL ACTIVITY</th>
<th>GAMBLING</th>
<th>GAMING</th>
<th>GENERAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TARGET GROUP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of children and adolescents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons spending much of their time at home with a consequential susceptibility to overuse of digital media (secondary school and university dropouts, unemployed, persons incapable to work)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISTRIBUTION CHANNELS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the media aiming primarily at children and adolescents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation of the Internet, the Virtual World and the new digital media not yet covered by the existing legislation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on advertising within computer and video games</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓ Austria X Slovakia 0

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAIN ISSUES</th>
<th>ALCOHOL</th>
<th>TOBACCO</th>
<th>NUTRITION</th>
<th>PHYSICAL ACTIVITY</th>
<th>GAMBLING</th>
<th>GAMING</th>
<th>GENERAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Violations of advertising provisions</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violations of introduced restrictions</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>X 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring and evaluation violations of introduced restrictions</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existence of illegal forms, globalization and its impact on tools for electronic communication</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online sales and advertising by companies headquartered in other countries</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdated legislation: (digital) marketing channels not covered by the legislation introducing marketing restrictions simply because they were developed after the adoption of the relevant legislative acts</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing self-regulation is not successful</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulations of online sales (looking, for example, into ways alcohol purchases performed by minors are addressed)</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The industry avoids itself of problematic forms of advertising, i.e. surreptitious advertising (e.g. with brand name logos)</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduce a full ban on advertising is missing</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban all sponsorships and donations aimed at the promotion is missing</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special attention to be given to a ban on sales promotion activities</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish a system detecting, monitoring and evaluating marketing communication messages in all the media, including the world wide web and mobile applications, to guarantee a better surveillance</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More knowledge and studies of the impact of advertising of product on (mental and physical) health are missing</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td>✓ 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ✓ Austria X Slovakia 0
What are the key obstacles (inhibitory factors) for improvement of the situation? (7-9)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY OBSTACLES</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omnirepresent advertising</td>
<td>O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-existent / inappropriate (outdated national and EU legislation)</td>
<td>☑ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inappropriate / inconsistent implementation of the existing legislation</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low legal penalties</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for political will and consensus</td>
<td>☑ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for a large societal consensus</td>
<td>☑ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of awareness (and/or knowledge) of health impacts</td>
<td>☑ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor labelling (without health warnings or a list of ingredients and composition)</td>
<td>☑ O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product definitions are missing</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising panels may be adopting decisions that are perceived as problematic from the point of view of public health</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicate the need for the advertising practice of industry for appropriate knowledge, as well as human and financial resources</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In general is profitability more important than regulation</td>
<td>O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-functioning legal restrictions</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties in implementation of legal restrictions</td>
<td>O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Internet remains an unregulated territory where advertisements “attack from behind every corner” – on all the websites</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addicts do not respond to logical arguments their addicted brain works differently, they are incapable of thinking about the consequences of their behaviour – working with them is therefore particularly difficult</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addicts cannot be ‘brought to their senses’ by unethical advertising</td>
<td>☑</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ☑ Austria X Slovakia ○

What are the key enablers (facilitating factors) for improvement of the situation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY ENABLERS</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobilisation of Public opinion polls</td>
<td>☑ X O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bringing forward consumers’ and citizens’ rights</td>
<td>☑ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raising the awareness of consumers and citizens</td>
<td>☑ X O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing the general public about health impacts and their consequences</td>
<td>☑ X O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better intersectoral cooperation</td>
<td>X O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better international cooperation</td>
<td>☑ X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More comprehensive and effective prevention, field work, advisory services</td>
<td>X O</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Slovenia ☑ Austria X Slovakia ○

LEFT – RIGHT DIFFERENCE
What are the most promising steps forward for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing?

**Slovenia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STEPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GENERAL</td>
<td>• uniform definitions of specific areas (using the same denominators) and the upgrading of the existing definitions&lt;br&gt;• defining digital marketing as an integrated health and lifestyle determinant (KNSD); defining possible common starting points and activities&lt;br&gt;• determining the power and scope of marketing channels for all the possible areas&lt;br&gt;• systematic communication about the listed topics with the general population, as well as with different target groups&lt;br&gt;• increasing the knowledge in the expert communities&lt;br&gt;• creating the basis for a decision on how to best restrict or reduce the pressure of digital marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALCOHOL</td>
<td>• raising the awareness of consumers and citizens&lt;br&gt;• record of outdated and adoption of new EU directives and regulations&lt;br&gt;• updating poor and inappropriate legislation, as well as adopting new elements of the national legislation when needed&lt;br&gt;• the implementation of the existing legislation&lt;br&gt;• a review of the applications submitted by advertising chambers and panels&lt;br&gt;• cooperation with other EU member states in the field of marketing restrictions&lt;br&gt;• removing alcohol from the list of food products&lt;br&gt;• estimate of the state of affairs and monitoring of the practice within the industry, with a focus on digital advertising&lt;br&gt;• estimate of the response of the population and its subgroups to advertising, with special attention being paid to digital advertising&lt;br&gt;• the industry’s estimate of compliance with self-regulation and legislation (national and in other countries); possible differences in advertising between domestic and foreign industries (e.g. emotionally charged messages, apparent social responsibility)&lt;br&gt;• estimate of short- and long-term marketing impact on public health&lt;br&gt;• raising the awareness of the general public through information about the harmful nature of alcohol consumption (no threshold), particularly in children and adolescents because of the impact on their brain development&lt;br&gt;• raising the awareness of the general public about marketing and its characteristics within the parallel virtual world, together with strategies and tactics needed to understand these messages and develop resilience&lt;br&gt;• special emphasis on programmes promoting lifestyle change (acceptable public image, especially for men) and intergenerational transmission of behavioural patterns&lt;br&gt;• regular monitoring and consideration of the public’s stance on arguments advocating restrictions on alcohol consumption and the prevention of harmful alcohol use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOBACCO</td>
<td>• optimising the implementation of the existing legislation&lt;br&gt;• raising the awareness of consumers and citizens, different stakeholder groups and policy-decision makers&lt;br&gt;• intersectoral cooperation with improved multidisciplinary competences&lt;br&gt;• cooperation with other EU member states and with WHO EURO region and globally with the WHO level in the field of marketing restrictions in all lifestyle areas&lt;br&gt;• developing common understanding of digital marketing issues and particular mechanisms at the individual and societal level&lt;br&gt;• participatory agenda for reducing marketing pressure to children with defined responsibilities of all stakeholder groups&lt;br&gt;• transparent, independent and regular monitoring and evaluation of digital marketing and relevant measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUTRITION</td>
<td>• interdisciplinary character of efforts to reduce pressure in digital marketing and more generally, harmful effects, extremism and violence on internet. With reference to the questionnaire we have consulted Ministries of agriculture, economy, culture, interior and Public Health Authority. &lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Health, Ministry of Interior and other relevant stakeholders will organize in January 2018 a joint workshop within the process of creating common interdisciplinary standards for the protection of young people's health. &lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Interior [Mental Health and risky behavior prevention]&lt;br&gt;• Example: ongoing efforts in the area of prevention of risky behavior&lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Health together with Ministry of Interior and other involved stakeholders will organize in January 2018 a joint workshop within the process of creating common interdisciplinary standards for the protection of young people's health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAMBLING AND GAMING</td>
<td>• estimated of the state of affairs&lt;br&gt;• prevention, field work, advisory services&lt;br&gt;• record of outdated and adoption of new EU directives and regulations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What are the most promising steps forward for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing?

**Austria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STEPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOBACCO</td>
<td>- ban of distance sales&lt;br&gt;- complete ban of advertising, sponsoring, marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUTRITION</td>
<td>- ATU welcomes the revision of the AVM-Directive. The final Directive will be an EU-wide mandatory framework, that will help at implementing national legislative.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Slovakia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STEPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GENERAL</td>
<td>• interdisciplinary character of efforts to reduce pressure in digital marketing and more generally, harmful effects, extremism and violence on internet. With reference to the questionnaire we have consulted Ministries of agriculture, economy, culture, interior and Public Health Authority. &lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Health, Ministry of Interior and other relevant stakeholders will organize in January 2018 a joint workshop within the process of creating common interdisciplinary standards for the protection of young people's health. &lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Interior [Mental Health and risky behavior prevention]&lt;br&gt;• Example: ongoing efforts in the area of prevention of risky behavior&lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Health together with Ministry of Interior and other involved stakeholders will organize in January 2018 a joint workshop within the process of creating common interdisciplinary standards for the protection of young people's health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERDISCIPLINARY</td>
<td>- in 2015, out of the 80 cases detected, up to 15 cases were committed within the virtual space, that is, they were committed in connection with activities on the Internet and various social networks (especially Facebook).&lt;br&gt;• In the year 2016, 58 cases of extremism crimes were detected within the Slovak Republic, out of which 21 were cleared up.&lt;br&gt;• The method of committing this type of crime was also shifted in 2016 from a &quot;street&quot; to the Internet and social networks.&lt;br&gt;• Criminal activities committed in the virtual environment were characterized by hate speech, ascriptions, and sympathy for various racist individuals or objects.&lt;br&gt;• The Slovak Republic sees extremism and hate speech as a modern phenomenon that needs to be addressed adequately. In June 2016, The Committee for the Prevention and Elimination of Racism, Xenophobia, Anti-Semitism and Other Forms of Intolerance has set up a working group on internet hate speech, which is also working to create a specific data collection system in this area. The source of information is the possibility to report such cases to the public either by email: <a href="mailto:extrem@mrvs.sk">extrem@mrvs.sk</a> (NIA operator) or <a href="http://stips.sk/naspeko">http://stips.sk/naspeko</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUTRITION</td>
<td>- raising the awareness and increasing the knowledge in the expert communities&lt;br&gt;• Ministry of Economy As a challenge for the future and a step forward, we see scope for setting up rules on cooperation between supervisory authorities and the social media. The problem may be that of spreading inappropriate advertising through social networks, as the supervisory authorities do not have any means of tracking the dissemination of such advertising. Therefore, we consider it appropriate to adopt measures that would allow the blocking of illegal advertising on social networks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are the most promising steps forward for reducing or restricting pressure in digital marketing?

**Slovakia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
<th>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STEPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **GENERAL** - plus Mental Health | Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development:  
Current challenges of the impact of advertising and marketing on the child population are likely to be the responsibility of several sectors, and the tasks arising from these challenges also need to be addressed in the context of inter-agency cooperation.  
From the point of view of substance, we identified the potentially problematic impact of advertising and marketing, especially in the area of eating the under-served population, such as failing to respect the need to reduce total fat, sugar, or increase in fruit and vegetable consumption.  
The agriculture sector has long been developing a wide range of activities in this area. A good example is the “Talks about eating” project, whose primary task is to raise awareness of food security and healthy nutrition. We also consider the School Fruit and Vegetables School and School Milk Program, which since 1 August 2017 have been integrated into one legal framework to increase efficiency. The aim is, above all, to improve the eating habits of children.  
In the framework of future steps, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development is ready to cooperate with involved stakeholders at the level of professional discussion in order to solve new challenges in this area.  
Ministry of Culture  
The limitations introduced by the Broadcasting and Retransmission Act for the protection of minors are, as mentioned above, taken from the Audiovisual Media Services Directive. The directive is currently under intense negotiations on its review. Since the Audiovisual Media Services Directive on the Protection of Minors in Audiovisual Media Services establishes a primary regulatory framework at European Union level, which will be applied with the greatest possible likelihood to video sharing platforms in the near future. it will be necessary to transpose changes that the revised text in the area of protection of minors. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ALCOHOL</th>
<th>Ministry of Health / Public Health Authority:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- need for stricter advertising rules</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| TOBACCO | - to update legislation for new marketing channels  
- to ensure the controllability of violation of rules in the digital world |

| NUTRITION | - to increase number of studies of the impact of product advertising on health  
- raise the awareness of citizens’ rights concerning advertising  
- consistent prosecution of violations of rules  
An effective instrument would be a single EU restrictive legislation with regard to digital marketing targeting the child population |

| GAMBLING | - prevention, field work, advisory services |

| GAMING | - prevention, field work, advisory services |

---

**NIJZ National institute of Public Health**  
**World Health Organization**

Let’s join public health capacities and do something together 😊
8 Opportunities and barriers for policy interventions

(Cristina Chiotan, EuroHealthnet)

The policy interventions at the EU and national/regional level can be broadly divided into:
- mandatory policy, i.e. legislation/directive or regulation;
- voluntary policy/agreements, i.e. national level schemes of self and co-regulation.

The national laws or EU Directives are enforced by controls applied by the public sectors for example, 20% limit of advertising time as mentioned in the EU Audio Video Media Services Directive (AVMSD). For this type of policy impact assessments and continuous monitoring are crucial for implementation.

Among the voluntary agreements the most commonly used is the self and co-regulation involving commitments of the industry and other relevant stakeholders towards achieving specific objectives. Recommendations and guidelines are also often issued at EU level being proposed by the Commission and approved by the Council.

Within the legislation the EU and countries can use economic/fiscal measures, such as:
- Taxation: Taxing products or processes that are harmful, or reducing taxation of products that are beneficial;
- Subsidies: financial support to SMEs or small enterprises that support/promote healthy products and services;
- Fees and user charges- charging to punish deviations from the law/data protection, etc.;
- Investments in Research and Development – improve knowledge on health impacts;
- Investments in Education and Training (school, higher education/university, life-long learning) – investments in digital and commercial health literacy.

Policy implementation can be supported through various actions/interventions of communication, marketing of education campaigns:
- public reporting of deviations (i.e. disclosure about companies non-compliant)
- social marketing - media campaigns
- advice/information centers for adolescents and parents - provide information on digital health literacy and negative impacts.

To ensure maximum implementation the legislative measures could be endorsed by economic/fiscal measures and accompanied by interventions and actions.

An example of EU policy is represented by the new proposal of the European Commission to revise the AVSMD. Being driven by the need for a better balance of rules the proposal introduces flexibility when restrictions only applicable to TV are no longer justified. At the same time, it aims to ensure that consumers will be sufficiently protected in the on-demand and Internet world. While strengthening the country of origin principle (i.e. simplify the rules
to determine the country having jurisdiction) it establishes the obligation of the Member States to inform about what providers are under their jurisdiction and maintaining an up-to-date database to ensure transparency.

In terms of commercial communications, it maintains the strict 20% limit on advertising time, but gives broadcasters more flexibility as to when ads can be shown, and allows more flexibility in putting product placement and sponsorship. In relation with the protection of minors, the proposed modifications aim at simplifying the obligation to protect minors against harmful content, with everything that 'may be harmful' should be restricted on all services and the most harmful content shall be subject to the strictest measures, such as PIN codes and encryption.

In relation with protecting the most vulnerable the proposal encourages the adoption of self- and co-regulation for the existing rules seeking to protect the most vulnerable (alcohol advertising, fatty food, minors, etc.).

A study on “Effectiveness of self- and co-regulation in the context of implementing the Audiovisual Media Services Directive (AVMSD)” published in 2016\(^1\) have evaluated the application of principles in national schemes in relation with protection of minors from harmful audiovisual content television and in on-demand Audio Media Services and on commercial communication in both television broadcasting and in on-demand AMS. The study has identified and assessed 33 self- and co-regulatory schemes identified in 25 MS.

The findings have shown that as regards participants, most participants were from industry with consumer and civil society groups often not represented. As regards the openness of participants there were rare cases where stakeholders felt excluded or information withheld, however the information was kept overall in a closed group. In terms of the good faith of participants, it was difficult to assess if real effort or commitment was made with no possibility to determine the capacity of each stakeholder involved. There was a good legal compliance in vast majority of schemes.

In most of the schemes analysed there was an overall general policy goal with less SMART objectives and indicators and evaluate which made it difficult to evaluate the impact of the scheme. There was also a lack of systematic process for improvement, and often no monitoring systems in place with few systems which assessed regularly performance and impact or identify areas for improvement.

The study concluded that national self of co-regulation schemes are often not formalised or established explicitly. There are no formal objectives, monitoring processes or evaluations

which weakness their effectiveness and impact. Out of 33 schemes identified and evaluated only four best practice cases were identified that can confirm that effective self- and co-regulation schemes, which fulfil the essential criteria of well-functioning self and co-regulation can be very effective.

**Key Sources:**


Opportunities and barriers for policy interventions

Cristina Chiotan, Policy Senior Coordinator

ABOUT EUROHEALTHNET

Objectives & key themes:

- Reducing Health Inequalities
- Combatting NCDs
- Health Promotion for sustainable health systems
  - SDH approach, HiAP
  - Life-course approach (children/ageing)
  - Sustainable development approach (social, environmental and economic)
**Regulation/Legislation/Guidelines**

Setting **rules and targets** (command) and ensuring that they are enforced (control) [Public sector]
Laws, directives
E.g. 20% *limit advertising time*

**Impact assessments** of new legislation or investment initiatives

**Voluntary agreements** (non mandatory): initiatives where firms, groups of companies or sectors agree to improve conduct
EU platforms, national level schemes/commitments, self and co-regulation

**Guidelines:** non mandatory

---

**Economic/fiscal measures**

**Taxation:** Taxing products or processes that are harmful, or reducing them where beneficial;

**Subsidies:** financial support to SMEs or small enterprises that support/promote healthy products and services

**Fees and user charges:** charging to punish deviations from the law/data protection, etc.

**Investments in Research and Development** – improve knowledge on health impacts

**Investments in Education and Training (school, higher education/university, life-long learning)** – investments in digital and commercial health literacy
Policy support for actions/interventions

Communication/Marketing/Guidelines (non mandatory)/Information

- deviations reporting – disclosure about companies non-compliant
- social marketing - media campaigns

Service Provision: support services
- advice/information centres for adolescents and parents - provide information on digital health literacy and negative impacts;
- Education and Training in schools to improve health literacy, sustainability

- Strengthen and invest in monitoring
An example: the EC proposal AVMSD

- **Country of origin principle**: determine country jurisdiction over provider and share info via database;
- **Commercial communications**: 20% limit advertising time, more flexibility on when, product placement and sponsorship; adoption of self and co-regulation to protect the most vulnerable (alcohol ads, fatty foods, minors, etc.)
- **Prohibition of hate speech** — expressions of racism and xenophobia
- **Protection of minors**: everything that may be harmful should be restricted on all services.
- **Video-sharing platform**: only when it comes to combat hate speech and dissemination of harmful content to minors.

Principles for Better Self- and Co-Regulation (1)

- **Participants**: all possible parties have come on board, each fully accountable and respected for their contributions.
- **Openness**: envisaged actions prepared openly; include the involvement of any interested parties: public authorities, enterprises, legislators, regulators and civil society.
- **Good faith**: bring all the information available; commit real effort to success; activities outside are coherent with the commitment and they can withdraw
Principles for Better Self- and Co-Regulation (2)

- **Objectives**: set out clearly and unambiguously; use well-defined baselines, include targets and indicators allowing an evaluation of the impact.
- **Legal compliance**: only applicable law and fundamental rights from the EU and national law.
- **Iterative improvements**: aim for a prompt start, with accountability and an iterative process of "learning by doing"; sustained interaction between all participants; annual progress checked.

Principles for Better Self- and Co-Regulation (3)

- **Monitoring**: sufficiently open and autonomous; each participant monitor its performance against agreed targets; public shared results Evaluation = action concluded, improved or replaced
- **Disagreements** inevitably arise involving either participants or others. As part of the iterative process of improvement, such disputes should receive timely attention, with a view to resolving them. These procedures may be confidential.
- **Financing**: participants to the action will provide the means necessary to fulfil the commitments; public support possible.
Study on the AVMSD 2010 (1)


Evaluate application of principles in national schemes:

- on protection of minors from harmful audiovisual content television and in on-demand AMS
- on commercial communication in both television broadcasting and in on-demand AMS

33 self- and co-regulatory schemes identified in 25 MS

---

Study on the AVMSD 2010 (2)

- Participants: consumer and civil society groups often not represented.
- Openness: rare cases where stakeholders felt excluded or information withheld; overall closed group
- Good faith: difficult to determine if real effort or commitment was made (exact capacities of each stakeholder involved was not known).
- Objectives: a general policy goal with less SMART objectives, including indicators to monitor and evaluate
Study on the AVMSD 2010 (3)

- **Legal compliance**: upheld in the vast majority of the schemes

- **Iterative improvements**: lack of systematic process for improvement

- **Monitoring**: There is often no system in place which specifically monitors the scheme objectives, and indicators and targets are often missing.

- **Evaluation**: Few systems to assess regularly performance, areas for improvement, and broader impact (appears to be due to the lack of SMART objectives with appropriate indicators and targets)

Study on the AVMSD 2010 (4)

- **Resolving disagreements**: complaints resolution system

- **Financing**: in many cases membership fees are the main source of financing; government support; offering services to participants; provision of a copy advice for an advertisement or the classification of a programme according to a classification system.
Thank you!

• Questions?

c.chiotan@eurohealthnet.eu
Short statement on technological options in Slovenia  

(Petra Zupančič, Agency for communication networks and services of the Republic of Slovenia)

Abstract

Agency for communication networks and services of the Republic of Slovenia (AKOS) is an independent body, which regulates electronic media on the basis of the Media Act and the Audiovisual Media Services Act.

The regulation/co-regulation of advertising to children in Slovenia applies exclusively in the field of traditional audiovisual (AV) media - television and radio. Social networks, internet platforms etc. are not defined as media according to current media legislation and therefore remain deregulated. Digital marketing is regulated only by self-regulatory codes. Co-regulation and self-regulation represent the future of the tendency to protect children from inappropriate advertising content in the digital world (in this direction also the current reform of the EU AVMS Directive), however individual countries report that the principle of self-regulation and voluntary codes do not produce the expected results.

AKOS also presented the regulatory practices of the EU Member States for the AV commercial messages for HFSS food in children's program and for alcohol. There is no uniform regulatory practice.

In the end, AKOS emphasized the role of regulatory agency in developing media/advertising literacy for children and adults - skills, knowledge and understanding, which enables effective and safe use of the media. Media education should be prioritized and placed in the school curriculum.

AKOS's practice and contribution is in accordance with comparable EU legislatory practice and its recommendations/baseline considerations/illuminations have substantial weight.

KeySources:

- Media Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 110/06, 36/08, 77/10, 90/10, 87/11, 47/12, 47/15, 22/16 and 39/1615/03)
- Audiovisual Media Services Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, number 87/11 and 84/15)
Regulatory framework for advertising to children in (traditional) media
(*in jurisdiction of the regulator for electronic media Agency for communication networks and services of the Republic of Slovenia (AKOS) on the basis of the Media Act and Audiovisual Media Services Act)

→ WHERE WE ARE:

- (Co-)regulation of advertising to children exclusively in the field of traditional audiovisual (AV) media – television (TV) and radio (in accordance with current media legislation, social networks, internet platforms etc. are not defined as media and therefore remain deregulated; digital marketing is regulated by self-regulatory codes) – media regulation in relation to child protection in the field of advertising includes only general principles regarding AV commercial messages and more specifically for high fat, salt, sugar (HFSS) foods (obligation per se) *see below

↓ issue: children are influenced by different media in different age periods – preschool children may be mainly addressed by TV, older children mainly move to other platforms (social networks, YouTube)

→ AV commercial messages to minors (product placement in content for children is not allowed; SEPARATION PRINCIPLE – advertising content clearly separated from other content) must not:

↓ issue: new, »soft« advertising techniques, e.g. »merchandising« – AV and food industry networking, »brand integration« – licensed cartoon characters in advertisements for HFSS food, »advergames«, »video advertising« etc.

- cause physical, mental or moral damage
- encourage them to buy or lease products due to their inexperience
- encourage them to persuade their parents to buy advertised goods
- show their peers in dangerous situations
Provider of AV media service formulates the RULES OF CONDUCT regarding inappropriate AV commercial messages for HFSS food in/along children’s program content, according to nutrition guidelines, announced by the minister for health. The provider must publish the Rules and forward them to the ministry, responsible for media, and to AKOS.

↓ issue: other programme content not primarily for children, although children represent an important proportion of the audience; broadcasted in time periods, when children follow the media, e.g. family films

↓ issue: HFSS food is still advertised to children, very small proportion of advertisement industry promotes healthy food (e.g. according to Consumers’ Association of Slovenia 50 % of the advertised breakfast cereals in Slovenia contain more than 30g of sugar/100g of the product)

↓ issue: what is the purpose of showing text messages promoting healthy lifestyle in the programme (for children) together with advertisements for HFSS food

→ WHERE ARE WE GOING:

- Co-regulation, self-regulation (collective responsibility; e.g. Code of Advertising Practice of Slovenia) – represent the future of tendency to protect children from inappropriate digital advertising (in this direction also the current revision of the Audiovisual Media Services Directive)

↓ issue: individual countries report that self-regulation and voluntary codes are not effective in achieving of the desired results

↓

MEDIA/ADVERTISING LITERACY – skills, knowledge and understanding that enable users to efficiently and safely use the media. Media regulators co-create web portals, cooperate with market stakeholders, support educational campaigns and awareness raising activities in educational institutions (for both children and teachers) – creating SCHOOL CURRICULUM in compliance with the competent authorities.

New advertising techniques (»digital marketing« – SEPARATION PRINCIPLE no longer applies) – personalization, interaction, integration – »brand integration/placement«, »advergames«, »video advertising«, »advertising connected to social media« (profiled targeting, so-called online »influencer« – blogs, vlogs), online banner, virtual world itd.
→ their subtle and contextual (merging editorial content with advertising content) nature necessarily requires
1) an informed individual/child who recognizes sublimated forms of media messages that address him as a consumer,
2) on platforms that can not be regulated by traditional regulation measures

→ REGULATORY PRACTICE OF EU COUNTRIES – AV COMMERCIAL MESSAGES FOR HFSS FOOD IN CHILDREN’S PROGRAM (26/28 Member States):

1. Legal regulation/co-regulation
   – RULES OF CONDUCT regarding inappropriate AV commercial messages for HFSS food in/along children’s program content (public broadcasting service and commercial media):
     - Austria (prohibition of any advertising in/directly before/after)
     - Belgium (French area) (conditionally in health legislation gives the king the power to act)
     - Cyprus
     - Estonia
     - France (signed food agreement between publishers, advertisers and TV producers under the ministry of health, culture and media regulator; also an agreement on promotion of a healthy lifestyle – obligatory publication of the message on a healthy diet)
     - Germany
     - Romania (participation of celebrities in advertisements for children under the age of 12 years is not allowed; promotional advertisements for a healthy lifestyle)
     - Slovenia
     - Spain

   – It is not allowed to encourage consuming HFSS food by AV commercial messages (legal requirement):
     - Belgium (Flemish area)
     - Germany

   – AV commercial messages for HFSS food are not allowed in children’s program:
     - Denmark (a ban on advertising within program content for children under the age of 13 years)
- **Ireland** (allowed in other programs, but insofar as they address children under certain conditions (see below) and to the maximum extent of 25% of advertising time; obligatory publication of the message on a healthy diet; ban on »pester power«; participation of celebrities for advertising purposes is not allowed)
- **Malta** (30 min before and 30 min after children’s program),
- **Poland**,
- **Sweden** (general ban on advertising to children)
- **Great Britain** (absolute ban in/during/after children's programs, in specialized children's programs and in program content for children under the age of 16 years; obligatory publication of the message on a healthy diet; absolute ban on promotional placement; ban on »pester power«; in advertisements for preschool and primary school children no promotional offers are allowed; participation of celebrities for advertising purposes is not allowed)

2. **Self-regulation**
   – **ADVERTISING/ETHICAL CODES OF AV MEDIA SERVICES PROVIDERS, ADVERTISERS, FOOD INDUSTRY:**
     - **Austria**
     - **Belgium** (French area)
     - **Belgium** (Flemish area)
     - **Bulgaria**
     - **Croatia**
     - **Cyprus**
     - **Czech Republic**
     - **Denmark** (code of conduct applies for traditional and so-called new media)
     - **Estonia**
     - **Finland**
     - **Germany** (including digital marketing)
     - **Greece**
     - **Italy**
     - **Ireland** (only video on demand)
     - **Latvia**
     - **Lithuania**
     - **Malta**
     - **Netherlands**
     - **Poland**
- Portugal
- Romania
- Slovakia (not specifically for children)
- Spain

REGULATORY PRACTICE OF EU COUNTRIES – AV COMMERCIAL MESSAGES FOR ALCOHOL
(23/28 Member States):
* in jurisdiction of the media regulators

1. Absolute ban on alcohol advertising (with time exceptions):
   - Belgium (Flemish area) (before/after children's program)
   - Estonia (applies to public broadcasting service; for other providers, ban on advertising between 7.00 and 21.00)
   - France
   - Hungary (applies to public broadcasting service; absolute ban on advertising spirits between 18.30 and 21.30)
   - Lithuania (between 18.00 and 23.00)
   - Malta (between 6.00 and 21.00)
   - Nizozemska (between 6.00 and 21.00)
   - Poland (exceptions: beer between 20.00 and 6.00, sports program content)
   - Portugal (between 7.00 and 22.30)
   - Sweden
   - Great Britain (before/during/after the program for young audience)

2. Absolute ban on spirits advertising (with time exceptions):
   - Austria
   - Belgium (French area) (applies to public broadcasting service; provider who advertises alcohol must ensure broadcasting time to the same extent for preventive awareness raising campaigns)
   - Bulgaria (indirect advertising allowed after 22.00)
   - Germany
   - Finland (absolute ban on alcohol advertising between 7.00 and 21.00)
   - Ireland (absolute ban on alcohol advertising during/along children's program)
   - Italy (during/along children’s program)
   - Latvia
   - Romania (between 6.00 and 22.00)
- Slovenia
- Spain (absolute ban on alcohol advertising between 6.00 and 20.30)

*PRACTICE OF EU COUNTRIES, see more:
https://www.dlapiper.com/~/media/Files/Insights/Publications/2016/12/3169756_UNICEF_Advertising_To_Children_Update_V8.pdf

→ A few challenges for the future – which is already here:

1. MEDIA/ADVERTISING LITERACY – the role of the regulator in developing media literacy of both parents and children (web portal, workshops within the school curriculum, participation in awareness-raising campaigns, promotion of complaint tools etc.)
2. MEDIA EDUCATION – as a priority, classification of a compulsory school subject; curriculum needs to follow the development of advertising techniques and the level of exposure to advertising in individual age groups
3. (PROMOTION OF) HEALTHY EATING HABITS – the role educational system and media
4. While excessively regulating exclusively traditional media we forget, that children are more and more addressed by other deregulated internet platforms-new advertising forms whose broadcasting is unlimited in both scope and time.
5. Too strict requirements in the field of traditional media can lead to movement of advertisers to other, less regulated platforms.
6. Providers of AV media can create a better quality program (also) with the help of advertising resources.
7. Regulation of advertising to children in children program does not take into account program content with high proportion of children among the audience (e.g. family films)
8. Continuous and coordinated cooperation with clearly defined goals between the two holders of regulatory powers NIJZ and AKOS and other stakeholders.
10 Conclusions and recommendations

Setting the scene

Preventing and controlling NCDs, as well as risk factors of NCDs, is one of the major development imperative for the 21st century (WHO, 2017). Since exposure to risk factors begins in childhood, protecting children from adverse impacts of marketing, including DM, is important for reducing risk factors for NCDs (WHO, 2013). Digital technologies, which are widely used by children across Europe, offer rapidly evolving practices of marketing and advertising, including personal data collection and emotional persuasion, to achieve greater advertisement attention, more positive brand attitudes, and higher product sales in comparison to traditional marketing platforms (e.g. broadcasting) (WHO, 2016).

Current knowledge and public health approaches are not adequate for controlling (prevention, monitoring, counteracting) DM, therefore the NIJZ decided to launch a Digital marketing initiative. Capacity building workshop 2017 on Digital marketing to children - methodological challenges in linking public health siloses was organized by the NIJZ, and the WHO Country Office for Slovenia.

The aim of this workshop was to define how to proceed in the area of digital and other types of marketing of different lifestyle risk factors to children with the following objectives:
- to raise awareness and to build capacity for Slovene health promotion workforce in the area of DM;
- to define common denominators for more efficient work in the area of DM of “lifestyle products” to children and adolescent in Slovenia;
- to develop background materials and recommendations for the work in the area of DM to children in the future;
- to contribute to the work of WHO in compiling evidence and best practices to tackle the growing problem of digital marketing to children.

Lectures on principles of DM, legislative issues and technological options, presentation of experience of the participating countries and possibilities for public health action were followed by round-table discussions on recommendations for further steps. Participants have voted for ideas they considered most important. Ideas most commonly voted for were collected under the following subsections: ethics, governance and leadership, framing and regulation, capacity building, research, and call on immediate actions. They are presented below.
1. Ethics

General need for further elaboration of ethical issues of DM was stressed. Lack of transparency on individuals’ information collection, analysis, selling, and ownership was pointed out as controversial, especially given the low level of awareness of persuasive techniques, inherent to DM, and the addictive nature of digital media. Social norms were recognized as the broader context of DM to children. Indeed, policy can support social norm changes by clearly stating their priorities, helping address even global problems (Nyborg et al, 2016). It was expressed that currently business interest (profit) is much stronger than public interest and that parents are more likely addicted to digital media as before, which could be among main inhibitory factors in the process of changing social norms related to DM to children. However, nongovernmental organizations (NGO) programmes focusing on personal development of children were identified as a key enabling factor. Putting focus on quality relationships, family life and common activities was recommended.

2. Governance and leadership

Absence of specific dedicated working group addressing the problem of DM within institutional and political framework was recognized. Establishing an intersectoral body, responsible for framing DM, and putting the issue of DM into strategies and agendas of broad circle of institutions was recommended. Since DM is a global issue including various sectors, it was recommended to address it on the level of the UN. Public health was proposed to take over the leadership regarding the problematics of DM on national and international levels.

3. Framing and regulation

Lack of recommendations and regulation in the area of DM to children was recognized. It was stressed that data collection, analysis, dissemination/selling and ownership should be transparent by the industry and that data extraction from minors should be limited/stopped. The need for clear regulation of media marketing was recommended, especially regarding updated definitions in digital media and appropriate extension of rules for broadcasting also to digital media.

4. Capacity building

More resources for governance and capacity building are needed to act effectively in this relatively new and challenging area. In turn, organized civil society groups will be stimulated to gain and disseminate knowledge to the general public. It was pointed out, that general
public is unaware of subliminal messages, present in the content of DM, and their addictive nature. Raising public awareness and improvement of digital literacy of children, parents, teachers, etc. (possibly placed in the school curriculum), and empowerment of parents and future parents through education about possible harms due to DM to children was recommended.

5. Research

Lack of knowledge on DM, its techniques, and impacts was recognized. Research results and knowledge dissemination to a broad range of experts and audiences is vital.

6. Call on immediate actions

As a general recommendation, it was stressed, that even if we lack sufficient knowledge on the problematics of DM, we should immediately start taking action that follow from the above recommendations. Equally important is monitoring and evaluating these actions as ongoing.

7. Conclusions and recommendations of the workshop

Immediate action is needed to frame DM to children, which would among others include:
- establishing an inter-sectoral body;
- providing more capacities and resources for public health actions in the area of digital marketing, together with increasing multidisciplinary competences;
- further elaboration ethical issues;
- ensuring transparency of personal data extraction, storage, sale, and ownership in the digital media, and limit emotionally persuasive and/or addictive techniques and/or targeted advertising of DM, especially for minors;
- developing clear regulation on digital marketing;
- raising public awareness and improving digital media literacy;
- stimulating research fully characterising the digital marketing children are exposed to and noting their differential susceptibility.
11 References


World health organization. Major NCDs and their risk factors (http://www.who.int/ncds/introduction/en/).


A number of references are included in the presentations.